## **EXHIBIT A**

## THOMAS W. BEVAN, ESO. - 04/05/2018

```
1
                IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 2
                  FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY
 3
 4
      KIMBERLEE WILLIAMS,
                                 ) CASE NO. 2:11-CV-01754
      et al.,
                                  ) (JLL)(JAD)
 5
                 Plaintiffs,
 6
      versus
 7
                                  ) CONTINUED DEPOSITION OF
      BASF CATALYSTS, LLC,
 8
      et al.,
                                  ) THOMAS W. BEVAN, ESQ.
 9
                 Defendants.
10
11
                             VOLUME II
12
13
           Continued Deposition of THOMAS W. BEVAN, ESQ., a
14
      Witness herein, called by the Defendants for
15
      Cross-Examination pursuant to the Federal Rules of
      Civil Procedure, taken before me, the undersigned,
16
17
      Anika W. Patrick, a Registered Merit Reporter,
18
      Certified Realtime Reporter and Notary Public in and
      for the State of Ohio, at the offices of Thompson Hine,
19
      LLP, 3900 Key Center, 127 Public Square, Cleveland,
20
21
      Ohio, on Thursday, April 5, 2018, at 1:15 p.m.
22
23
24
25
```

THOMAS W. BEVAN, ESQ. - 04/05/2018 Pages 96..99

		THOMAS W. BEVAN,	FOQ	• -	- 04/05/2018 Pages 9699
1		Page 96 my question from last time. I don't need to	1		Page 98 conversations with somebody from the Placitella
2			2		firm.
3	7	debate it with you.	3	^	Who?
	Α.	I understood it very well, and I read it again and		Q.	
4		I understood it when I read it again, and you said	4	Α.	I know I've talked to Jared Placitella and I know
5		it wasn't produced and you asked me why it wasn't	5		I've talked to Chris Placitella and I know I've
6	_	produced.	6	_	talked to Harry Roth.
7	Q.	Sir	7	Q.	Have you communicated withdrawn.
8		MR. McDERMOTT: Objection to this line of	8		Have you personally communicated with
9		questioning.	9		attorneys from the Cohen Placitella firm in
10		MR. ROTH: Just move on.	10	_	writing?
11	_	MR. McDERMOTT: Move to strike.	11	Α.	By e-mail.
12	Q.	I'm not here to argue with you. I wasn't	12	Q.	So you've
13		dishonest with you last time. Who else was in	13	Α.	Yes.
14		your conversation with Mr. Roth last night?	14	Q.	exchanged are you finished?
15	_	MR. McDERMOTT: Continuing objection.	15	Α.	Yes.
16	Α.	Mr. Walsh was there.	16	Q.	You've exchanged e-mail correspondence with Cohen,
17	Q.	What did Mr. Walsh say?	17		Placitella & Roth?
18	Α.	I introduced him or he introduced himself to	18	Α.	Yes.
19	_	Mr. Roth.	19	Q.	Do those e-mails appear on the Bevan Law Firm's
20	Q.	So you, Mr. Roth, Mr. Walsh. Anybody else?	20		privilege log?
21	Α.	Mr. Placitella. Jared Placitella.	21	Α.	I don't know.
22	Q.	Anybody else?	22	Q.	Who would know that?
23	A.	Maybe Erin Clark. I'm not sure if she was still	23	Α.	I assume either people from the Placitella firm or
24	_	in the room or not.	24		people from Mr. Little's office.
25	Q.	Was this a phone conversation or in person?	25	Q.	How many e-mails have you exchanged with Cohen,
		Page 97	_		Page 99
1	Α.	It was an in-person meeting.	1		Placitella & Roth?
2	Q.	Did you ever review any documents to prepare for	2	Α.	Many dozens, probably.
3		today?	3	Q.	Going back to early 2011?
4	Α.	The deposition, I reviewed.	4	Α.	I don't know when I first communicated with them
5	Q.	Anything else?	5	_	by e-mail.
6	Α.	I don't think so.	6	Q.	It's fair to say over the course of multiple
7	Q.	Did you review any of the documents that your firm	7		treams though?
8				_	years, though?
	_	produced in the Williams case?	8	Α.	Yes.
9	A.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I	9	A. Q.	Yes. Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated
9	Α.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed	9	Q.	Yes. Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?
9 10 11		I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.	9 10 11	Q. A.	Yes. Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail? I am Mr. Walsh would have.
9 10 11 <b>12</b>	A. Q.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen	9 10 11 12	Q.	Yes. Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail? I am Mr. Walsh would have. Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen
9 10 11 12 13		I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other	9 10 11 12 13	Q. A.	Yes. Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail? I am Mr. Walsh would have. Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have
9 10 11 12 13 14	Q.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night?	9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. A. Q.	Yes. Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail? I am Mr. Walsh would have. Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?
9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. A.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night?  I am yes, I have.	9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. A. Q.	Yes.  Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?  I am Mr. Walsh would have.  Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?  I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs.
9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. A. Q.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night?  I am yes, I have.  When?	9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. A. Q.	Yes.  Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?  I am Mr. Walsh would have.  Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?  I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs.  Have you collected Mr. Walsh's communications with
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. A. Q. A.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night?  I am yes, I have.  When?  At various times. I couldn't give you the days.	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. A. Q. A. Q.	Yes. Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail? I am Mr. Walsh would have. Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants? I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs. Have you collected Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. A. Q.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night?  I am yes, I have.  When?  At various times. I couldn't give you the days. So you've had multiple communications with the	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Q. A.	Yes.  Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?  I am Mr. Walsh would have.  Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?  I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs.  Have you collected Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  I yes, I believe so.
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. A. Q. A.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night?  I am yes, I have.  When?  At various times. I couldn't give you the days. So you've had multiple communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your February 21st	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. A. Q. A. Q.	Yes.  Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?  I am Mr. Walsh would have.  Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?  I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs.  Have you collected Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  I yes, I believe so.  What did you do with Mr. Walsh's e-mail
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q. A. Q. A.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night?  I am yes, I have.  When?  At various times. I couldn't give you the days. So you've had multiple communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your February 21st deposition?	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. A. Q. A. Q.	Yes.  Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?  I am Mr. Walsh would have.  Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?  I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs. Have you collected Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  I yes, I believe so.  What did you do with Mr. Walsh's e-mail communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. A. Q. A.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night?  I am yes, I have.  When?  At various times. I couldn't give you the days. So you've had multiple communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your February 21st deposition?  MR. McDERMOTT: Objection.	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A. Q. A. Q. A.	Yes.  Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?  I am Mr. Walsh would have.  Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?  I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs.  Have you collected Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  I yes, I believe so.  What did you do with Mr. Walsh's e-mail communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  They would have been turned over to our counsel.
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A. Q. A.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night?  I am yes, I have.  When?  At various times. I couldn't give you the days. So you've had multiple communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your February 21st deposition?  MR. McDERMOTT: Objection.  MR. ROTH: Objection.	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A. Q. A. Q.	Yes.  Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?  I am Mr. Walsh would have.  Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?  I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs.  Have you collected Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  I yes, I believe so.  What did you do with Mr. Walsh's e-mail communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  They would have been turned over to our counsel.  So Mr. Little has Mr. Walsh's e-mail
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A. Q. A.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night? I am yes, I have.  When?  At various times. I couldn't give you the days. So you've had multiple communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your February 21st deposition?  MR. McDERMOTT: Objection.  MR. ROTH: Objection.  MR. McDERMOTT: Mischaracterization.	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	Yes.  Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?  I am Mr. Walsh would have.  Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?  I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs.  Have you collected Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  I yes, I believe so.  What did you do with Mr. Walsh's e-mail communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  They would have been turned over to our counsel.  So Mr. Little has Mr. Walsh's e-mail communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Q. A. Q. A. Q.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night? I am yes, I have.  When?  At various times. I couldn't give you the days. So you've had multiple communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your February 21st deposition?  MR. McDERMOTT: Objection.  MR. ROTH: Objection.  MR. McDERMOTT: Mischaracterization.  Move to strike.	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A.	Yes.  Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?  I am Mr. Walsh would have.  Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?  I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs.  Have you collected Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  I yes, I believe so.  What did you do with Mr. Walsh's e-mail communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  They would have been turned over to our counsel.  So Mr. Little has Mr. Walsh's e-mail communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  I believe so.
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A. Q. A.	I have not reviewed them a second time. I reviewed them originally, but I have not reviewed them again.  Have you had any communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your last deposition other than the discussion last night? I am yes, I have.  When?  At various times. I couldn't give you the days. So you've had multiple communications with the Cohen Placitella firm since your February 21st deposition?  MR. McDERMOTT: Objection.  MR. ROTH: Objection.  MR. McDERMOTT: Mischaracterization.	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	Yes.  Has anyone else from the Bevan firm communicated with Cohen, Placitella & Roth via e-mail?  I am Mr. Walsh would have.  Are Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm on any privilege log that have been produced to the defendants?  I don't know. I haven't seen any privilege logs.  Have you collected Mr. Walsh's communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  I yes, I believe so.  What did you do with Mr. Walsh's e-mail communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?  They would have been turned over to our counsel.  So Mr. Little has Mr. Walsh's e-mail communications with the Cohen Placitella firm?

## THOMAS W. BEVAN, ESO. - 04/05/2018 Pages 100..103

```
Page 100
                                                                                                                    Page 102
           Placitella firm?
                                                                           Are any of those agreements reflected on a
 1
                                                                 1
 2
      Α.
          I believe counsel does.
                                                                 2
                                                                           privilege log that has been prepared on behalf of
 3
           Mr. Little?
                                                                            the Bevan Law Firm?
                                                                 3
 4
          I believe so.
                                                                           I don't know.
 5
          Anyone else -- withdrawn.
                                                                 5
                                                                           Does the Bevan Law Firm have any agreements with
                                                                            the Cohen Placitella firm regarding compensation
 6
                    Has anyone else from the Bevan Law Firm
                                                                 6
                                                                            that might be paid to your firm if the plaintiffs
 7
           had e-mail communications with Cohen, Placitella &
                                                                 7
 8
           Roth?
                                                                 8
                                                                            in the Williams case receive compensation?
 9
                                                                 g
                                                                                     MR. ROTH: Objection. Form and
           Probably Erin Clark.
     A.
10
          Anyone other than Erin Clark?
                                                                10
                                                                                foundation.
11
          I don't think so.
                                                                11
                                                                                     MR. McDERMOTT: Same objection. You can
           Have Ms. Clark's e-mail communications with Cohen
                                                                12
12
                                                                                go ahead and answer, Tom.
13
           Placitella been provided to Mr. Little?
                                                                13
                                                                      A.
                                                                           Yes.
                                                                           Are those agreements reflected on a privilege log
14
          I believe so.
                                                                14
     Α.
                                                                      ٥.
15
          Do you have any agreements -- withdrawn.
                                                                15
                                                                            that has been produced to the defendants in the
16
                    Does your law firm have any agreements
                                                                16
                                                                           Williams case?
                                                                17
                                                                           I don't know.
17
           with the Cohen Placitella firm regarding the
18
           referral of clients to Cohen Placitella?
                                                                           Are your law firm's agreements with the Cohen
                                                                18
19
                    MR. ROTH: Objection. Form, foundation,
                                                                19
                                                                            Placitella firm regarding compensation that might
20
                                                                20
                                                                           be paid to your firm in writing?
               privilege.
21
                                                                21
                    MR. McDERMOTT: Objection. I instruct
                                                                                     MR. ROTH: Objection.
22
               you not to answer that, Tom.
                                                                22
                                                                                     MR. McDERMOTT: Same objection. You can
23
                    THE WITNESS: Okay.
                                                                23
                                                                                go ahead and answer, Tom.
24
          I'm not asking you for the substance of the
                                                                24
                                                                           Yes.
                                                                      A.
25
           agreements, Mr. Bevan. I'm just asking whether
                                                                25
                                                                           Does the Bevan Law Firm have agreements with the
                                                                                                                    Page 103
                                                    Page 101
                                                                            Cohen Placitella firm regarding apportionment of
1
           they exist. Can you tell me "yes" or "no" whether
                                                                 1
 2
           your firm has agreements with the Cohen Placitella
                                                                 2
                                                                            attorneys' fees that might be paid in the Williams
 3
           firm regarding the referral of clients?
                                                                 3
                                                                            case?
                    MR. ROTH: Same objection.
                                                                  4
                                                                                     MR. ROTH: Objection. Move to strike.
 5
                    MR. McDERMOTT: Same objection.
                                                                 5
                                                                                     MR. McDERMOTT: Same objection.
                    THE WITNESS: Same instruction?
                                                                                     MR. ROTH: We're way beyond a --
 6
 7
                                                                 7
                    MR. FARRELL: Are you instructing him not
                                                                                     MR. McDERMOTT: 30(B)(5).
 8
                                                                 8
               to answer that question?
                                                                                     MR. ROTH: -- records custodian
 9
                    MR. McDERMOTT: Let's take a minute.
                                                                 9
                                                                                deposition. This is the subject of a motion
10
                    THE WITNESS: Okay.
                                                                10
                                                                                that's been disputed and I'm going to ask
11
                    MR. McDERMOTT: Let's walk out.
                                                                11
                                                                                that he be instructed not to answer.
12
                    MR. FARRELL: We're off the record.
                                                                                     MR. FARRELL: You're instructing him not
                                                                12
13
                    (Discussion off the record.)
                                                                13
                                                                                to answer on the basis of scope?
14
                    MR. FARRELL: Back on.
                                                                14
                                                                                     MR. ROTH: I asked his counsel to
15
                    MR. McDERMOTT: I'll withdraw my last
                                                                15
                                                                                instruct him not to answer.
                                                                                     MR. McDERMOTT: Repeat the question,
               objection.
16
                                                                16
17
                    MR. FARRELL: Back on the record. So I'm
                                                                17
                                                                                please.
18
               sorry, Counsel, you were withdrawing the last
                                                                18
                                                                                     (Whereupon, the Reporter read the record
19
                                                                19
               objection?
                                                                                     as requested.)
20
                    MR. McDERMOTT: Last objection.
                                                                20
                                                                                     MR. McDERMOTT: I'm going to object to
21
                                                                21
                                                                                that. It's privileged material. Don't
      BY MR. FARRELL:
22
          Okay. So my question to you, Mr. Bevan, was, does
                                                                22
                                                                                answer it.
23
           your law firm have agreements with the Cohen
                                                                23
                                                                                     THE WITNESS: Okay.
           Placitella firm regarding the referral of clients?
24
                                                                24
                                                                           You're following the instruction not to answer?
25
                                                                25
     Α.
          Yes.
                                                                      Α.
```